

COMMENCEMENT

The meeting opened at 4.50 pm.

IN ATTENDANCE

Clr Ross Williams	Councillor, Hunters Hill Council
Clr Jim Sanderson	Councillor, Hunters Hill Council
Michael Lehany	Landscape Adviser
Brian McDonald	Heritage Architect
Lucy Creagh	Hunters Hill Trust Representative
Helen Temple Berry	Community Representative

ALSO PRESENT

Steve Kourepis	Director, Development & Regulatory Services
Kate Higgins	Heritage Adviser

APOLOGIES

Bronwyn Doutreband	Community Representative
Peter Lonergan	Representative of the Institute of Architects
Graham Atkins	Community Representative (Alt)

DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

The Chairperson called for Declarations of Interest without response.

CONFIRMATION OF MINUTES

RECOMMENDATION

That the Minutes of Conservation Advisory Panel of the previous Meeting held on 21 April 2021 were read and were moved by Clr Jim Sanderson and Seconded by Brian McDonald.

REPORTS

3.1 5.00 PM - 18 THE POINT ROAD, WOOLWICH (PRELIMINARY)

PROCEEDINGS IN BRIEF

The Panel was addressed by:

- Basil Kalkanas, owner
- Ramy Tawadros, architect
- Andrew Martin, Planner

In considering the proposal the Panel advised:

- There is some concern about the demolition of the existing house, although it was acknowledged that the original building has been considerably altered. There is the option to retain the house and to enhance it, while achieving an addition, although it was accepted that the house may be able to be demolished subject to the new building making a better contribution to the conservation area than the existing building.

- In general, there are serious concerns about the compatibility of the proposal with the conservation area - in particular with regard to the balance of landscaping and built form. The LEP 60% landscape area requirement must be met.
- Despite increased side setbacks, the proposal does not take the approach of a house set in a garden. Consideration should be given to reducing the footprint of the building to enable this to happen.
- The single storey presentation to the street is supported.
- The basement car parking is a concern. The driveway ramp consumes the front garden - resulting in a lack of deep soil area available for trees and garden. On grade car parking should be considered.
- The basement parking is of particular concern as only two cars will be accommodated - yet it would have a significant impact on the landscape character of the front garden. Other options that avoid a deeply descending driveway could be explored eg garage door at grade + car hoist + turntable, or a garage/carport in the existing or similar location
- There is a concern about the impact of the proposal on the Port Wine Magnolia and other trees. It is unacceptable that all the existing trees on the subject site are proposed to be removed except for the Blue Gum on the foreshore. Some of the trees on the site appear to be part of the original garden on the site. This must be investigated.
- The Blue Gum is not a commonly surviving tree in Hunters Hill.
- Existing trees could be saved and repositioned.
- Five trees with a mature height of 12 metres should be provided.
- The swimming pool should be repositioned so that the existing Cyprus pines can be retained.
- There is a significant issue in relation to the visual impact of the large terrace that projects towards the water, and the visual impact of the substantial retaining wall required. It was noted that the terrace extends beyond the foreshore building line. The existing "soft" presentation to the water will be lost which is unacceptable.
- The applicant needs to demonstrate that the substantial retaining wall for the terrace will not have a detrimental impact on the existing Blue Gum on the waterfront. The lack of a cross section in this area made it difficult for the panel to form an opinion about this matter.
- There is a concern about the quantum of landscape area. The paved terrace and entry are not landscaped areas.
- The foreshore building line needs to be clearly shown on all plans.
- It was queried as to whether the proposed travertine wall cladding is in keeping with the character of the conservation area. It was recommended that similarly high quality, but alternative claddings that are more consistent with traditional Hunters Hill buildings, be explored.
- The black and white colour scheme is also not in keeping with the character of the area.
- The house on the allotment to the west of the subject site is a very intact and important building and garden.
- The proposal will adversely impact the setting of the heritage items in the vicinity of the subject site. This is inconsistent with the heritage provisions of the LEP.

RECOMMENDATION

That the Director, Development and Regulatory Services, be advised that the Panel does not support the proposal in its present form and recommends that a revised design be prepared.

3.2 6.00 PM - 18 RYDE ROAD, HUNTERS HILL (PRELIMINARY)**PROCEEDINGS IN BRIEF**

The Panel was addressed by:

- John Macdonald, representative of St Joseph's College
- Matt Easdown, representative of St Joseph's College
- Matt Befumo, architect
- Luisa Alessi, Heritage consultant

In considering the proposal the Panel advised:

- Any new building must make an equal or better contribution to the conservation area than the existing building. The two storey scale and lack of landscaping (including lack of canopy trees) in the front garden makes this problematic.
- The swept path drawing demonstrates that the entire front garden area will be paved with no garden area. An important characteristic of Hunters Hill conservation area is that houses are set in gardens.
- The bulk and scale of the proposed building is too big for the site and the location.
- The double garage plus carports are problematic as they would dominate the front façade. The garages should be deleted - although the carports could be retained. The deletion of the garages would provide the opportunity for a revised design.
- A new building needs to be less imposing and less bulky. A first floor ceiling springing height of 1.8 metres was strongly suggested in order to reduce height.
- The symmetry of the front facade is out of character as it would exaggerate the scale (the neighbouring building to the south-east should not be taken as a positive precedent in this respect). It was recommended that the design have greater informality. The building could be designed to look like a single home - although it would encompass two dwellings and have two carparking spaces.
- The building should have north-facing windows to the street at ground floor level and not only the front doors.
- A single shared driveway could perhaps be considered.
- There is to be sufficient deep soil area for canopy trees and a garden setting in both the front and back gardens. Garden settings are traditional.
- Mid earthy tones and finishes are required as per the DCP controls.

RECOMMENDATION

That the Director, Development and Regulatory Services, be advised that the Panel does not support the proposal in its present form and recommends that a revised design be prepared.

OTHER BUSINESS

4.1 7.00 PM - COUNCIL POLICY ON THE SALE OF REMNANT LAND

PROCEEDINGS IN BRIEF

The Panel advised:

- The Panel is concerned that the impact of the sale of remnant land on the heritage values of Hunters Hill has not been properly investigated. A key principle of any policy must be that heritage values are retained, and preferably, enhanced. Any criteria applied to the sale of remnant land must consider heritage impacts.
- In the panel's view a policy for management of remnant lands should be based on a systematic study that informs a plan of management.
- The Panel is of the view that many "remnant" parcels of land make a positive contribution to the history and landscape character of Hunters Hill, as well as continue to provide public access to the foreshore that was historically available. The resultant benefits of these parcels of land to the community should be acknowledged at the start of the document.
- The Panel also stated that there may be unrealised opportunities available with regard to remnant land to enhance their contribution to and understanding of the heritage values of the area, and the community's management with the heritage values.
- The Panel noted that remnant land provides an area for trees and tree canopies that are so important for the green and leafy character of Hunters Hill.
- The Panel members advised that they will make a formal submission to Council on the policy.

RECOMMENDATION

That the Director, Development and Regulatory Services, be advised that the Panel

The meeting closed at 7:55pm.